UNITED NATIONS DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME Office of Audit and Investigations



AUDIT

OF

UNDP PROGRAMME OF ASSISTANCE TO THE PALESTINIAN PEOPLE

CONSTRUCTION OF 300 HOUSING UNITS IN RAFAH (Directly Implemented Project No. 42831, Output No. 99288)

Report No. 1942

Issue Date: 14 June 2018

United Nations Development Programme Office of Audit and Investigations



Report on the Audit of UNDP Programme of Assistance to the Palestinian People Construction of 300 Housing Units in Rafah (Project No. 42831, Output No. 99288) Executive Summary

The UNDP Office of Audit and Investigations (OAI), through Talal Abu-Ghazaleh & Co. (the audit firm), from 19 to 26 April 2018, conducted an audit of Construction of 300 Housing Units in Rafah (Project No. 42831, Output No. 99288) (the Project), which is directly implemented and managed by the UNDP Programme of Assistance to the Palestinian People (the Office). The last audit of the Project was conducted by OAI, through Deloitte, in 2017 and covered project expenses from 1 January to 31 December 2016.

The audit firm conducted a financial audit to express an opinion on whether the financial statements present fairly, in all material aspects, the Project's operations. The audit covered the Project's Combined Delivery Report, which includes expenses for the period from 1 January to 31 December 2017 and the accompanying Funds Utilization statement 1 as of 31 December 2017. The audit did not cover the Statement of Assets as no assets were held by the Project. In addition, the audit did not cover the Statement of Cash as no separate bank account was established and maintained for the Project.

The audit was conducted under the general supervision of OAI in conformance with the *International Standards* for the *Professional Practice of Internal Auditing*.

Audit results

Based on the audit report submitted by the audit firm, the results are summarized in the table below:

| Project | Expenses |
|------------------------|-------------|
| Amount (in \$ '000) | Opinion |
| 13,382 | Unqualified |

The audit did not result in any recommendations.

Management comments and action plan

Management comments and/or additional information provided have been incorporated in to the report, where appropriate.

Helge S. Osttveiten Director

Office of Audit and Investigations

Audit Report No. 1942, 14 June 2018: UNDP PAPP, DIM Project No. 42831

¹ The Funds Utilization statement includes the balance, as at a given date, of five items: (a) outstanding advances received by the project; (b) undepreciated fixed assets used at the project level; (c) inventory held at the project level; (d) prepayments made by the project; and (e) outstanding commitments held at the project level.

United Nations Development Programme

Financial Audit of Directly Implemented Project Managed by UNDP- Programme of Assistance to the Palestinian People (PAPP)

"Construction of 300 Housing Units in Rafah" (Project ID: 42831 - Output ID: 99288) For the Year Ended 31 December 2017

13 June 2018

<u>Talal Abu – Ghazaleh & Co.</u>
"<u>Certified Public Accountants</u>"



TABLE OF CONTENTS

| 1. | PART I - Executive Summary | 1 |
|------|---|----|
| 1.1. | Executive Summary | 1 |
| 1.2. | Audit Objectives | 2 |
| 1.3. | Scope of Audit: | 3 |
| 2. | PART II - Financial Audit Reports | 4 |
| 2.1. | Auditor's Report on Financial Position. | 4 |
| 2.2. | Combined Delivery Report CDR: | .6 |



Global Company for Auditing and Accounting

ركة تدقد ىـة عالمد ق ومحاس

1. PART I – EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1.1. Executive Summary:

This report represents the results of the financial audit conducted by Talal Abu -Ghazaleh & Co. on the project ID 42831 - Output ID 99288 "Construction of 300 Housing Units in Rafah" (the project), directly implemented by UNDP Programme of Assistance to the Palestinian People (PAPP) for the period from 1 January to 31 December 2017.

The audit was undertaken on behalf of UNDP, Office of Audit and Investigations (OAI) and mandated in accordance with the Contract for Professional Services signed between UNDP and Talal Abu -Ghazaleh & Co on 29 March 2018.

Audit opinions:

The following is the summary of the audit opinions provided:

| Report on | Type of opinion | Note |
|----------------------------|-----------------|--|
| Financial Position | Unmodified | |
| Statement of Fixed Assets | Not applicable | There are no fixed assets or equipment therefore, no audit opinion to be provided on the Statement of fixed assets. |
| Statement of Cash Position | Not applicable | There was no separate bank account for the project under audit therefore, no audit opinion to be provided on the Statement of Cash Position. |

Audit findings:

No findings have been identified as a result of our audit.

Follow-up on Previous year's audit recommendations:

The output ID 99288 was audited in the prior year. The previous year's audit report No. 1799 issued on 1 September 2017 for the project ID 42831 - output ID 99288 "Construction of 300 Housing Units in Rafah" for the period from 1 January to 31 December 2016 did not result on any recommendations.

Sincerely yours,

Jamal Milhem, CPA

Certified Accountant License # (100/98)

License No. 251/1997

Ramallah - Palestine, 13 June 2018

Green Tower Building 3rd Floor, Al-Nuzha Street Tel.: +970 229 88 220/1

Fax: +970 229 88 219

MEMBER OF THE FORUM OF FIRMS

tagi.com

P.O.Box: 1110 Ramallah, West Bank, Palestine tagco.ramallah@tagi.com

بناية البرج الاخضر الطابق الثالث، شارع النزهة هاتف: ۱/۲۲۰ ۸۸ ۲۲۰ ۲۹+ فاكس: ۲۲۹ ۸۸ ۲۱۹+ ص ب: ١١١٠ رام الله، الضفة الغربية، فلسطين

1.2. Audit Objectives

- A. The objective of the financial audit is to express an opinion on the project's financial position which includes:
- 1) Expressing an opinion on whether the expenses incurred by the Project from 1 January to 31 December 2017 and the funds utilization, the accounts receivable and the accounts payable as at 31 December 2017 were fairly presented in accordance with UNDP accounting policies and that the expenses incurred were: (i) in conformity with the approved project budgets; (ii) for the approved purposes of the project; (iii) in compliance with the relevant regulations and rules, policies and procedures of UNDP; and (iv) supported by properly approved vouchers and other supporting documents. The Combined Delivery Report (CDR) and the accompanying Funds Utilization statement are the mandatory and official statements upon which the audit opinion should be expressed. Other forms of statement of expenses that may be prepared by a project office are not accepted.
- 2) Expressing an opinion on whether the statement of fixed assets, at net book value, presents fairly the balance of depreciated assets of the UNDP Project as at 31 December 2017. This statement should include all assets available as at 31 December 2017 and not only those purchased in the period under audit. Where a DIM project does not have any assets or equipment it will not be necessary to express such an opinion; and
- 3) Expressing an opinion on whether the statement of cash held by the Project presents fairly the cash and bank balance of UNDP Project as at 31 December 2017. Disbursements made against directly implemented project, DIM projects are usually financed from the regular country office bank accounts. Exceptionally, a dedicated bank account may be opened and used solely for the cash transactions of a DIM project, e.g. if the project is in a remote location. The audit firm is required to express an opinion on the Statement of Cash only where a dedicated bank accounts for the DIM project has been established. In cases where the cash transactions of the audited DIM project are made through the country office bank accounts, this type of opinion is not required.
- B. Providing the progress made in implementing the recommendations raised in a previous year audit report (if any).

The financial audit was conducted in accordance with the International Standards on Auditing (ISA), the 700 series.

1.3. Scope of Audit:

The scope of the audit relates only to transactions concluded and recorded against the UNDP DIM project for the period from 1 January to 31 December 2017.

The scope of the audit did not include:

- Activities and expenses incurred or undertaken at the level of "responsible parties"; and
- Expenses processed and approved in locations outside the country such as UNDP Regional Centers and UNDP Headquarters and where the supporting documentation is not retained at the level of the UNDP office.



Global Company for Auditing and Accounting

ركة تدقد بة عالمي ق ومحاه

2. PART II – FINANCIAL AUDIT REPORTS

2.1. Auditor's Report on Financial Position

Independent Auditor's Report on the Project Financial Position of UNDP DIM Project ID 42831 - Output ID 99288 "Construction of 300 Housing Units in Rafah"

To the Director of the Office of Audit and Investigations (OAI) **United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)**

We have audited the financial position of the UNDP project ID 42831 - output ID 99288 "Construction of 300 Housing Units in Rafah", for the period from 1 January to 31 December 2017, which include: (a) the accompanying Combined Delivery Report (CDR); (b) the Funds Utilization Statement (the statement); and (c) the project related accounts receivable and accounts payable.

Unmodified Opinion

In our opinion, the accompanying Combined Delivery Report (CDR) and Funds Utilization Statement present fairly, in all material respects, the expenses of USD 13,382,379.38 directly incurred by UNDP PAPP and charged to the project ID 42831 – output ID 99288 for the period from 1 January to 31 December 2017 in accordance with UNDP accounting policies and were: (i) in conformity with the approved project budgets; (ii) for the approved purposes of the project; (iii) in compliance with the relevant regulations and rules, policies and procedures of UNDP; and (iv) supported by properly approved vouchers and other supporting documents.

Basis for Opinion

We conducted our audit in accordance with International Standards on Auditing (ISAs). Our responsibilities under those provisions and standards are further described in the auditor's responsibilities for the audit of the CDR and Funds Utilization section of our report. We are independent of UNDP in accordance with the International Ethics Standards Board of Accountants' Code of Ethics for Professional Accountants (IESBA Code), and we have fulfilled our other ethical responsibilities in accordance with this code.

We believe that the audit evidence we have obtained is sufficient and appropriate to provide a basis for our opinion.

Management's Responsibilities

Management is responsible for the preparation and fair presentation of the of the CDR and the Funds Utilization statement of the project and for such internal control as management determines is necessary to enable the preparation of a CDR and Funds Utilization statement that is free from material misstatement, whether due to fraud or error

Green Tower Building 3rd Floor, Al-Nuzha Street Tel.: +970 229 88 220/1

الطابق الثَّالث، شارع النزهة هاتف: ۱/۲۰ ۸۸ ۲۲۰ ۹۷۰ فاكس: ۹۷۰ ۲۲۹ ۸۸ ۲۱۹

بناية البرج الاخضر

tagi.com

FORUM OF FIRMS

ص ب: ١١١٠ رام الله، الضفة الغربية، فلسطين

Auditor's Responsibilities for the Audit

Our objectives are to obtain reasonable assurance about whether the CDR and the Funds Utilization statement are free from material misstatement, whether due to fraud or error, and to issue an auditor's report that includes our opinion. Reasonable assurance is a high level of assurance, but is not a guarantee that an audit conducted in accordance with ISAs will always detect a material misstatement when it exists. Misstatements can arise from fraud or error and are considered material if, individually or in the aggregate, they could reasonably be expected to influence the economic decisions of users taken on the basis of these documents.

As part of an audit in accordance with ISAs, we exercise professional judgment and maintain professional skepticism throughout the audit. We also:

- Identify and assess the risks of material misstatement of the CDR and Funds Utilization statement, whether due to fraud or error, design and perform audit procedures responsive to those risks, and obtain audit evidence that is sufficient and appropriate to provide a basis for our opinion. The risk of not detecting a material misstatement resulting from fraud is higher than for one resulting from error, as fraud may involve collusion, forgery, intentional omissions, misrepresentations, or the override of internal control.
- Obtain an understanding of internal control relevant to the audit in order to design audit procedures that are appropriate in the circumstances, but not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the effectiveness of the organization's internal control.

We communicate with those charged with governance regarding, among other matters, the planned scope and timing of the audit and significant audit findings, including any significant deficiencies in internal control that we identify during our audit.

Jamal Milhem, CPA

Certified Accountant License # (100/98)

Talal Abu –Ghazaleh & Co.

License No. 251/1997

Ramallah – Palestine, 13 June 2018



2.2 Combined Delivery Report (CDR) and Funds Utilization Statement

Combined Delivery Report By Project

UN Development Programm Report ID: unglcdrp

Page 1 of 4 Run Time: 26-02-2018 20:02:52

Selection Criteria:

Business Unit: PAL10
Period: Jan-Dec (2017)
Selected Project Id: ALL
Selected Fund Code: ALL
Selected Dept. IDs: ALL
Selected Outputs: 00099288

| | t ld: 00042831 PAL/ Construction of 300 H t #: 00099288 repair damaged housing ur | | Period : Impl. Partner : Location : | Jan-Dec (2017) 02388 UNDP - PAPP | |
|------------|--|----------|---|-------------------------------------|---------------|
| A PARTY OF | | Govt Exp | UNDP Exp | UN Agencies Exp | Total Exp |
| Dept: | 70001 (PAPP - Central) | | | | |
| Fund: | 30000 (PROGRAMME COST SHARING) | | | | |
| | 64397 - Services to projects -CO staff | 0.00 | 840.00 | 0.00 | 840.00 |
| | 71305 - Local ConsultSht Term-Tech | 0.00 | 122,872.00 | 0.00 | 122,872.00 |
| | 71360 - Local Consult-Security | 0.00 | 1,508.92 | 0.00 | 1,508.92 |
| | 71405 - Service Contracts-Individuals | 0.00 | 52,324.04 | 0.00 | 52,324.04 |
| | 71410 - MAIP Premium SC | 0.00 | 444.88 | 0.00 | 444.88 |
| | 71415 - Contribution to Security SC | 0.00 | 11,121.66 | 0.00 | 11,121.66 |
| | 71505 - UN Volunteers-Stipend & Allow | 0.00 | 3.093.19 | 0.00 | 3,093,19 |
| | 71520 - UNV-Language Allowance | 0.00 | 150.00 | 0.00 | 150.00 |
| | 71525 - UNV-Hazard Pay | 0.00 | 927.96 | 0.00 | 927.96 |
| | 71535 - UNV-Medical Insurance | 0.00 | 455.13 | 0.00 | 455,13 |
| | 71540 - UNV-Global Charges | 0.00 | 190.12 | 0.00 | 190.12 |
| | 71541 - UNVs-Contribution to security | 0.00 | 193.32 | 0.00 | 193.32 |
| | 71550 - UNV-Resettlement Allowance | 0.00 | 258.61 | 0.00 | 258.61 |
| | | | 747.00 | 0.00 | 747.00 |
| | 71590 - UNV Development Effectiveness | 0.00 | | | |
| | 72105 - Svc Co-Construction & Engineer | 0.00 | 1,119,870.91 | 0.00 | 1,119,870.91 |
| | 72170 - Svc Co-Humanitarian Aid & Relf | 0.00 | 11,602,998.05 | 0.00 | 11,602,998.05 |
| | 72405 - Acquisition of Communic Equip | 0.00 | 3,750.00 | 0.00 | 3,750.00 |
| | 72425 - Mobile Telephone Charges | 0.00 | 1,379.74 | 0.00 | 1,379.74 |
| | 72705 - Hospitality-Special Events | 0.00 | 110.31 | 0.00 | 110.31 |
| | 73405 - Rental & Maint-Other Office Eq | 0.00 | 681.51 | 0.00 | 681.51 |
| | 74210 - Printing and Publications | 0.00 | 20.53 | 0.00 | 20.53 |
| | 74325 - Contrib.To CO Common Security | 0.00 | 5,460.00 | 0.00 | 5,460.00 |
| | 74510 - Bank Charges | 0.00 | 80.00 | 0.00 | 80.00 |
| | 74596 - Services to projects -GOE | 0.00 | 360.00 | 0.00 | 360.00 |
| | 75105 - Facilities & Admin - Implement | 0.00 | 452,544.33 | 0.00 | 452,544.33 |
| | 76135 - Realized Gain | 0.00 | - 2.83 | 0.00 | - 2.83 |
| Total fo | or Fund 30000 | 0.00 | 13,382,379.38 | 0.00 | 13,382,379.38 |
| Total fo | or Dept : 70001 | 0.00 | 13,382,379.38 | 0.00 | 13,382,379.38 |
| Dept: | 70002 (PAPP - UN Dev Coord) | | | | |
| Fund: | 30000 (PROGRAMME COST SHARING) | | | | |
| | 71405 - Service Contracts-Individuals | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| | 75105 - Facilities & Admin - Implement | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Total fo | or Fund 30000 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Total fo | or Dept : 70002 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |

Ramzy Whader Top project Manager 26-2-20180000 In Al Hussein Strongram Specialist 26/2/2018



Combined Delivery Report By Project

UN
DIP UN Development Programme
Report ID: unglcdrp

Page 2 of 4 Run Time: 26-02-2018 20:02:52

| Project Id: 00042831 PAL/ Construction Output #: 00099288 repair damaged h | | Period : Impl. Partner : Location : | Jan-Dec (2017) 02388 UNDP - PAPP | |
|---|----------|---|-------------------------------------|---------------|
| | Govt Exp | UNDP Exp | UN Agencies Exp | Total Exp |
| Total for Output: 00099288 | 0.00 | 13,382,379.38 | 0.00 | 13,382,379.38 |
| Project Total : | 0.00 | 13,382,379.38 | 0.00 | 13,382,379.38 |

Signed By: Ramzy Mhader project Marayer 26-2-2018 Marayer Signed By: The Al Husselini Japany Date: 26/2/2018

Talal Abu-Ghazaleh & Co.

Combined Delivery Report By Project

DP UN Development Programme Report ID: unglcdrp

Page 3 of 4 Run Time: 26-02-2018 20:02:54

Selection Criteria:

Business Unit: PAL10
Period: Jan-Dec (2017)
Selected Project Id: ALL
Selected Fund Code: ALL
Selected Dept. IDs: ALL
Selected Outputs: 00099288

| Project Id: ALL Output #: ALL | | Period : Impl. Partner : Location : | Jan-Dec (2017) | |
|-------------------------------|----------|---|-----------------|---------------|
| | Govt Exp | UNDP Exp | UN Agencies Exp | Total Exp |
| 70001 - PAPP - Central | 0.00 | 13,382,379.38 | 0.00 | 13,382,379.38 |
| 70002 - PAPP - UN Dev Coord | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |

Ramey Mulk The propert Manager 26-2-2018

Ina Al Hussen





Combined Delivery Report By Project

DP UN Development Programme Report ID: unglcdrp

Page 4 of 4 Run Time: 26-02-2018 20:02:56

| Funds Utilization | |
|---|-----------------------------|
| Selection Criteria : | |
| Business Unit: PAL10 Period: Jan-Dec (2017) Selected Project Id: ALL Selected Fund Code: ALL Selected Dept. IDs: ALL Selected Dept. IDs: ALL Selected Opt. IDs: ALL | |
| Project/Award: 00042831 PAL/ Construction of 300 Housi | Period : As at Dec 31, 2017 |
| | |
| Output # 00099288 Impl. Partner :02388 UNDP - PAPP | UNDP AMOUNT |
| Output # 00099288 Impl. Partner :02388 UNDP - PAPP Outstanding NEX advances | UNDP AMOUNT 0.00 |
| | |
| Outstanding NEX advances | 0.00 |
| Outstanding NEX advances Undepreciated Fixed Assets | 0.00 |
| Outstanding NEX advances Undepreciated Fixed Assets Unamortized Intangible Assets | 0.00 0.00 0.00 |

Ramey Whater of propert Manager 26-2-21

