UNITED NATIONS DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME Office of Audit and Investigations



AUDIT

OF

UNDP Pakistan

Early Recovery Programme in Pakistan (Directly Implemented Project No. 76295)

> Report No. 990 Issue Date: 19 June 2013



Report on the audit of UNDP Pakistan Early Recovery Programme in Pakistan (Project No. 76295) Executive Summary

From 18 October 2012 to 15 January 2013, the Office of Audit and Investigations (OAI) of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), through Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder - Pakistan (the audit firm), conducted an audit of the Early Recovery Programme in Pakistan, Project No. 76295 (the Project), which is directly implemented and managed by the UNDP Country Office in Pakistan (the Office). The audit was conducted under the general supervision of OAI in conformance with the *International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing*. The last audit of the Office was conducted by OAI in 2012.

The Project reported expenditure totalling \$5.7 million during the period from 1 January 2010 to 31 March 2012. The Project was funded by UNDP and Japan.

Audit scope and objectives

The audit work covered financial transactions as well as internal controls and systems for the purpose of expressing an opinion on whether the financial statements present fairly, in all material aspects, the Project's operations, as well as assess compliance with UNDP regulations, rules, policies and procedures and donor agreements. The audit covered the Project's Statement of Expenditure (Combined Delivery Report) for the period from 1 January 2010 to 31 March 2012 and Statement of Assets as of 31 March 2012. It also reviewed the relevant systems, procedures and practices in place as they relate to the Project, in the areas of: organization and staffing, project management, human resources management, financial and cash management, procurement, asset management, information systems and general administration.

Audit rating

Based on the audit report and corresponding management letter submitted by the audit firm, OAI assessed the management of the Project as **partially satisfactory**, which means "Internal controls, governance and risk management processes were generally established and functioning, but needed improvement. One or several issues were identified that may negatively affect the achievement of the objectives of the audited entity." The details of the audit results are presented in Figures 1 and 2.

	Project Expenditure			oject Assets
Amount (in \$ '000)	Opinion	NFI (in \$ '000)	Amount (in \$′000)	Opinion
5,689	Qualified	55	58	Unqualified

Figure 1: Summary results of the financial audit

NFI = Net Financial Impact

The audit firm qualified its opinion on project expenditure due to the following:

(a) Expenses amounting to \$425,000 for the period ending 31 December 2011 had been classified into the incorrect chart of accounts. This amount represents various types of expenses which the Office had incorrectly recorded in the 'grants to institutions' account.



(b) Inadequate supporting documents were provided for expenses amounting to \$55,000, thus the audit firm was unable to ascertain the acceptability and chargeability of these expenses to the Combined Delivery Report.

Figure 2: Internal controls and systems audit ratings summary

	Audit Areas	Not Assessed/ Not Applicable	Unsatisfactory	Partially Satisfactory	Satisfactory
1.	Organization and staffing				
2.	Project management				
3.	Human resources management				Million Million
4.	Financial and cash management				
5.	Procurement				
б.	Asset management				Bat all of
7.	Information systems				
8.	General administration				

Key issues and recommendations

The audit raised 13 issues and resulted in no recommendations, mainly because the Project had ended. Among the issues raised in this report, those that could be considered the most significant are presented below:

Human resources management (Issue 4)	Lack of controls to detect addition or deletion of employees in the payroll system. The Human Resources Associate can add or delete employees in the payroll system. System generated notifications for additions or deletions of employees from the payroll could not be generated from the beginning of the Project until January 2012. There were no substitute manual controls available to mitigate the risks associated with the payroll system system prior to January 2012.
Asset management (Issue 12)	Assets not returned to the Project. Six responsible parties did not return project assets amounting to \$18,452 to the Office after the completion of the Project.

Management's comments

The Resident Representative agreed with all 13 issues raised.

Antoine Khoury

Officer-in-Charge Office of Audit and Investigations

United Nations Development Programme Pakistan

Financial Audit Report

Early Recovery Programme in Pakistan

Project ID: 00076295

Audit Period: From 01 January 2010 to 31 March 2012

Contents

Financial Statements Certification

Certification of Statement of expenditure (CDR)	1
Statement of expenditure (CDR)	3
Certification for Statement of Assets	13
Statement of Assets	15



Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder Chartered Accountants Progressive Plaza, Beaumont Road, P.O. Box 15541, Karachi 75530, Pakistan Tel: +9221 3565 0007 Fax: +9221 35681965 www.ey.com

Independent auditors' Report to the United Nation Development Programme (UNDP) in respect of "2010 Flood Response Early Recovery Programme" (Project ID 00076295)

We have audited the accompanying statements of expenditure [Combined Delivery Reports (CDRs)] of the UNDP Project **"2010 Flood Response Early Recovery Programme"** under **Project ID 00076295** (here-in-after referred to as "the statements") for the periods ended 31 December 2010, 31 December 2011 and 31 March 2012 (periods taken as a whole).

Management is responsible for the preparation of the statements of the UNDP Project "2010 Flood Response Early Recovery Programme" under Project ID 00076295 and for such internal control as management determines is necessary to enable the preparation of the statements that are free from material misstatement, whether due to fraud or error.

Our responsibility is to express an opinion on these statements based on our audit. We conducted our audit in accordance with International Standards on Auditing. Those standards require that we comply with ethical requirements and plan and perform the audit to obtain reasonable assurance about whether the statements are free from material misstatement.

An audit involves performing procedures to obtain audit evidence about the amounts and disclosures in the statements. The procedures selected depend on the auditor's judgment, including the assessment of the risks of material misstatement of the statement, whether due to fraud or error. In making those risk assessments, the auditor considers internal control relevant to the Project's preparation of the statements in order to design audit procedures that are appropriate in the circumstances, but not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the effectiveness of the Project's internal control. An audit also includes evaluating the appropriateness of accounting policies used and the reasonableness of accounting estimates made by management, as well as evaluating the overall presentation of the statements.

We believe that the audit evidence we have obtained is sufficient and appropriate to provide a basis for our **qualified** opinion.

- a) expenses amounting to \$0.425 million for the period ended 31 December 2011 had been classified into incorrect chart of accounts. This amount represents various types of expenses which have been incorrectly entered into the account namely "grants to institutions"; and
- b) Inadequate supporting documents were provided for expenses aggregating to \$0.055 million, thus not enabling us to ascertain the acceptability and chargeability of these expenses to the CDRs.

EYENSU



-:2:-

In our opinion, except for the effect(s), if any, of the matters stated in the paragraphs (a) and (b) above, the statements present fairly, in all material respects, the expenses of \$5.689 million incurred by the Project for the period from 01 January 2010 to 31 March 2012 in accordance with the UNDP accounting policies and such expenses were:

- a) in conformity with the approved Project budgets;
- b) for the approved purposes of the Project;

- c) in compliance with the relevant regulations and rules, policies and procedures of UNDP; and
- d) supported by properly approved vouchers and other supporting documents.

We draw attention to the fact that, during the period, the Office's management has used two different accounting policies with respect to recognition of assets in the statements in respect of this Project. Prior to 31 December 2011, these were charged off as expenses in the statements, whereas subsequent thereto, these have been recognized as assets and related depreciation has been charged in the statements. The policy change resulted from UNDP Executive Board's decision to adopt International Public Sector Accounting Standards (IPSAS) w.e.f 01 January 2012.

We draw attention to the fact that, during the period, the Office's management has followed two different accounting policies with respect of charging of expenses in the statements. Prior to 31 December 2011, these were charged off on disbursement basis, whereas subsequent thereto, these have been charged on accrual basis. The policy change resulted from UNDP Executive Board's decision to adopt International Public Sector Accounting Standards (IPSAS) w.e.f 01 January 2012.

Eui & Yong Fred Rent Sidar Hyde

Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder Chartered Accountants Engagement Partner: Omar Mustafa Ansari

Date: 17 May 2013 Place: Karachi



Statement of expenditure (CDR) For the period from 01 July 2010 to 31 December 2010

Combined Delivery Report By Project

UN Development Programme Report ID: ungl143p

Page 1 of 2 Run Time: 16-05-2013 09:05:43

Selection Criteria :

3

Business Unit : PAK10 Period : Jan-Dec (2010) Selected Award Id : ALL Selected Fund Code : ALL Selected Dept. IDs : ALL Selected Projects : 00076295

Award Id : 00060551 ER Programme for flood affted Project # : 00076295 Community Capacity Building			Period : Impl. Partner : Location :	Jan-Dec (2010) 02373 UNDP (D Pakistan	irect Execution)	
		Govt Disb	UNDP Disb	UN Agencies	Encumbrance	Total Exp
Dept: 42401 (Pakistan - Central)						
und: 26931 (CPR TTF – Disaster)						
72205 - Office Machinery 72210 - Machinery and Equipmen 72406 - Security communication e 72805 - Acquis of Computer Hard	quipme	0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00	1,118.60 11,459.31 18,774.20 14,300.02	0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00	0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00	1,118.60 11,459.31 18,774.20 14,300.02
Total for Fund 26931		0.00	45,652.13	0.00	0.00	45,652.13
Total for Dept : 42401		0.00	45,652.13	0.00	0.00	45,652.13
Dept: 42403 (Pakistan - Crisis Prev & F	Rcvry)					
Fund: 26931 (CPR TTF – Disaster)						
71405 - Service Contracts-Individi 71610 - Travel Tickets-Local 71615 - Daily Subsistence Allow-1 71620 - Daily Subsistence Allow-1 72120 - Svc Co-Trade and Busine 72405 - Acquisition of Communic 72410 - Acquisition of Audio Visuu 73410 - Maint, Oper of Transport 76125 - Realized Loss 76135 - Realized Gain	Intl Local ess Serv Equip al Eq	0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.0	34,824.52 1,811.71 0,00 1,299.51 1,188,558.86 1,705.88 0,00 1,557.65 1,00 -0.75	0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.0	0.00 0.00 0.00 1.865,868.63 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00	34,824.52 1,811.71 0.00 1,299.51 3.054,427.49 1,705.88 0.00 1,557.65 1.00 - 0.75
Total for Fund 26931		0.00	1,229,758.38	0.00	1,865,868.63	3,095,627.01
Total for Dept : 42403		0.00	1,229,758.38	0.00	1,865,868.63	3,095,627.01
		0.00	1,275,410.51	0.00	0.00	3,141,279.14

1,275,410.51

0.00

0.00

0.00 3,141,279.14

Eu

Signed By :

ac

Award Total :

Douglas Hageman Country Director a.i. United Nations Development Programme Islamabad, Pakistan

16 Date :



Statement of expenditure (CDR) For the period from 01 July 2010 to 31 December 2010



Combined Delivery Report By Project

UN DP UN Development Programme Report ID: ungl143p

Selection Criteria :

Business Unit : PAK10 Period : Jan-Dec (2010) Selected Award Id : ALL Selected Fund Code : ALL Selected Dept. IDs : ALL Selected Projects : 00076295

Page 2 of 2 Run Time: 16-05-2013 09:05:46

ERNST & YOUNG KARACH

Award Id : 0006 Project # :	60551 ER Programme for flood a Community Capacity Build		Period : Impl. Partner : Location :	Jan-Dec (2010) None Pakistan		
		Govt Disb	UNDP Disb	UN Agencies	Encumbrance	Total Exp
42401 - Pakistan - Central 42403 - Pakistan - Crisis Prev & Rcvry		0.00	45,652.13 1,229,758.38	0.00 0.00	0.00 1,865,868.63	45,652.13 3,095,627.01
					EUFMA	
					Sold Rhodes	Side





Statement of expenditure (CDR)

For the period from 01 January 2011 to 31 December 2011

Combined Delivery Report By Project

UN DI2 UN Development Programme Report ID: ungi143p

Page 1 of 4 Run Time: 16-05-2013 09:05:25

Selection Criteria :

(1)

Business Unit : PAK10 Period : Jan-Dec (2011) Selected Award Id : ALL Selected Fund Code : ALL Selected Dept. IDs : ALL Selected Projects : 00076295 Award Id : 00060551 ER Programme for flood affred

Award Id : 00060551 ER Programme for flood afft Project # : 00076295 Community Capacity Buildin			Period : Impl. Partner :	Jan-Dec (2011) 02373 UNDP (Direct Execution)	
Froject # . 000/0295 Community Capacity Building		building	Location :	Pakistan	Sheet Execution,	
		Govt Disb	UNDP Disb	UN Agencies	Encumbrance	Total Exp
ept: 4	2401 (Pakistan - Central)					
und : 2	6931 (CPR TTF – Disaster)					
	2140 - Svc Co-Information Technolo 2406 - Security communication equi		0.00 6,390.71	0.00 0.00	0.00	0.00 6,390.71
otal for l	Fund 26931	0.00	6,390.71	0.00	0.00	6,390.71
und: 3	2045 (JPN - Partnership Devt Pgm	PCF)				
	4525 - Sundry 5105 - Facilities & Admin - Impleme	0.00 0.00	361.74 25.32	0.00 0.00	0.00	361.74 25.32
otal for	Fund 32045	0.00	387.06	0.00	0.00	387.06
otal for	Dept : 42401	0.00	6,777.77	0.00	0.00	6,777.77
ept: 4	2402 (Pakistan - UN Dev Coord)					
und: 3	2045 (JPN - Partnership Devt Pgm	PCF)				
	1405 - Service Contracts-Individuals 5105 - Facilities & Admin - Impleme		21.19 1.48	0.00	0.00	21.19 1.48
otal for	Fund 32045	0.00	22.67	0.00	0.00	22.67
otal for	Dept : 42402	0.00	22.67	0.00	0.00	22.67
Dept: 4	2403 (Pakistan - Crisis Prev & Rov	(עזי)				
und: 0	4170 (TRAC 3 DISASTER RISK RE	EDUCTION)				
67777777777777777777777777777777777777	13535 - Contribution to Security 55135 - Payroll Mgt Cost Recovery A 1205 - Intl Consultants-Sht Term-Te 1210 - Intl Consultants-Sht Term-Te 11310 - Local ConsultShort Term-S 1405 - Service Contracts-Individual 1610 - Travel Tickets-Local 1620 - Daily Subsistence Allow-Loc 1635 - Travel - Other 172105 - Svc Co-Construction & Engi 172105 - Svc Co-Construction & Engi 172105 - Svc Co-Communications Se 172160 - Svc Co-Ceducation & Health 172165 - Svc Co-Social Svcs, Social 1 17210 - Machinery and Equipment 172405 - Security communication equ 172415 - Courier Charges 172420 - Land Telephone Charges	ech 0.00 upp 0.00 s 0.00 s 0.00 s 0.00 s 0.00 neer 0.00 vice 0.00 vice 0.00 Serv 0.00 Ser 0.00 ser 0.00 ipme 0.00 0.00 0.00	4,290,28 497,97 17,156,00 1,498,00 11,493,17 267,714,13 3,499,36 9,071,28 194,52 35,261,74 752,83 54,605,42 848,835,02 351,159,75 891,18 6,390,71 23,26 85,01	0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.0	0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.0	4,290.28 497.97 17,156.00 1,498.00 11,493.17 267.714.13 3,499.36 9,071.28 194.52 35,261.74 752.83 54,605.42 848,835.02 351,159.75 891.18 6,390.71 23.26 85.01 12,25 85.01
	72505 - Stationery & other Office Su 73110 - Custodial & Cleaning Servic		17.65 82.09	0.00	0.00	17.65 82.09



Financial Audit Report: Early Recovery Programme Project ID:00076295



Statement of expenditure (CDR) For the period from 01 January 2011 to 31 December 2011

Combined Delivery Report By Project

(4) UN DP UN Development Programme Report ID: ungl143p

Page 2 of 4 Run Time: 16-05-2013 09:05:25

Award Id: 00060551 ER Programme for flood aff Project #: 00076295 Community Capacity Buildi		Period : Impl. Partner :	Jan-Dec (2011) 02373 UNDP (D	irect Execution)	
Froject # : 00076295 Community Capacity Buildi	ng	Location :	Pakistan	neer Execution)	
	Govt Disb	UNDP Disb	UN Agencies	Encumbrance	Total Ex
73120 - Utilities	0.00	110.30	0.00	0.00	110.30
73410 - Maint, Oper of Transport Equip	0.00	5,226.62	0.00	0.00	5,226.62
74210 - Printing and Publications	0.00	319.03 889.02	0.00	0.00	889.03
74525 - Sundry 76125 - Realized Loss	0.00	11.78	0.00	0.00	11.7
76135 - Realized Gain	0.00	- 157.69	0.00	0.00	- 157.6
77305 - Salaries - IP Staff-TA	0.00	75,025.53	0.00	0.00	75,025.5
77310 - Post Adjustment - IP Staff-TA	0.00	7,032.02	0.00	0.00	7,032.0
77315 - Contrib-Med, SocIns-IP Staff-TA	0.00	1,441.16	0.00	0.00	1,441.1
77320 - Assg hardship & mob allow-TA	0.00	7,987.64	0.00	0.00	7,987.6
77330 - Ed Grt w/ Trvl&Allow-IP Stf-TA	0.00	1,495.32 2,751.35	0.00	0.00	1,495.3
77345 - Dep Allowances-IP Staff-TA 77357 - Repat. Grt/Comm Ann Lv-IP-TA	0.00	6,509.12	0.00	0.00	6,509.1
77375 - Contrib-Jt Staff Pens Fd-IP-TA	0.00	22,945.02	0.00	0.00	22,945.0
tal for Fund 04170	0.00	1,745,634.59	0.00	0.00	1,745,634.5
nd: 26931 (CPR TTF – Disaster)					
63520 - Personal Security Measures	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0
63535 - Contribution to Security	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0
65135 - Payroll Mgt Cost Recovery ATLA 71205 - Intl Consultants-Sht Term-Tech	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0
71210 - Intl Consultants-Sht Term-Supp	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0
71310 - Local ConsultShort Term-Supp	0.00	- 6,806.58	0.00	6,806.58	0.0
71405 - Service Contracts-Individuals	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
71610 - Travel Tickets-Local	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
71620 - Daily Subsistence Allow-Local	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0
71635 - Travel - Other	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0
72105 - Svc Co-Construction & Engineer	0.00	0.00	0.00	- 1,865,868.63	- 591,344.
72120 - Svc Co-Trade and Business Serv 72135 - Svc Co-Communications Service	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.1
72160 - Svc Co-Education & Health Serv	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
72165 - Svc Co-Social Svcs, Social Sci	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
72210 - Machinery and Equipment	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
72370 - Security related goods and mat	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
72406 - Security communication equipme	0.00	- 6,390.71	0.00	0.00	- 6,390.
72415 - Courier Charges 72420 - Land Telephone Charges	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
72505 - Stationery & other Office Supp	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
73110 - Custodial & Cleaning Services	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
73120 - Utilities	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
73410 - Maint, Oper of Transport Equip	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
74210 - Printing and Publications	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
74525 - Sundry	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
76125 - Realized Loss 76135 - Realized Gain	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
77305 - Salaries - IP Staff-TA	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
77310 - Post Adjustment - IP Staff-TA	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
77315 - Contrib-Med, SocIns-IP Staff-TA	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
77320 - Assg hardship & mob allow-TA	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
77330 - Ed Grt w/ Trvl&Allow-IP Stf-TA	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
77345 - Dep Allowances-IP Staff-TA	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.
77357 - Repat. Grt/Comm Ann Lv-IP-TA 77375 - Contrib-Jt Staff Pens Fd-IP-TA	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0
otal for Fund 26931	0.00	1,261,326.45	0.00	- 1,859,062.05	- 597,735.
und: 32045 (JPN - Partnership Devt Pgm PCF)					
63535 - Contribution to Security	0.00	1,145.50 384.72	0.00	0.00	1,145.
65135 - Payroll Mgt Cost Recovery ATLA	0.00	304.12	0.00	0.00	304



Sec



Statement of expenditure (CDR) For the period from 01 January 2011 to 31 December 2011



UN DIP UN Development Programme Report ID: ungl143p

Combined Delivery Report By Project

Page 3 of 4 Run Time: 16-05-2013 09:05:26

rect Execution)	02373 UNDP (D Pakistan	Impl. Partner : Location :	ng	ward Id : 00060551 ER Programme for flood affted oject # : 00076295 Community Capacity Building	
Encumbrance	UN Agencies	UNDP Disb	Govt Disb	L	
0.00	0.00	11 000 00	0.00	71210 - Intl Consultants-Sht Term-Supp	
				71405 - Service Contracts-Individuals	
				71610 - Travel Tickets-Local	
				71610 - Travel Tickets-Local 71615 - Daily Subsistence Allow-Intl	
				71620 - Daily Subsistence Allow-Local	
				72115 - Svc Co-Natural Resources & Env	
				72120 - Svc Co-Trade and Business Serv	
				72135 - Svc Co-Communications Service	
				72160 - Svc Co-Education & Health Serv	
				72210 - Machinery and Equipment	
				72220 - Furniture	
				72410 - Acquisition of Audio Visual Eq	
				72425 - Mobile Telephone Charges	
				72605 - Grants to Instit & other Benef	
				73105 - Rent	
0.00				73110 - Custodial & Cleaning Services	
0.00	0.00			73120 - Utilities	
				73410 - Maint, Oper of Transport Equip	
0.00	0.00			74210 - Printing and Publications	
0.00	0.00	48.320.03	0.00	74525 - Sundry	
0.00	0.00			75105 - Facilities & Admin - Implement	
0.00	0.00	0.00		75709 - Learning - training of counter	
0.00	0.00	2,239.60	0.00	76120 - Unrealized Loss	
0.00	0.00	19.77	0.00	76125 - Realized Loss	
0.00	0.00	- 8.84	0.00	76135 - Realized Gain	
0.00	0.00	28,637.60	0.00	77205 - Salaries - GS Staff-TA	
0.00	0.00	5,586.09	0.00	77210 - Contrib to UNJSPF-GS-TA	
0.00	0.00	1,749.58	0.00	77215 - Contrib-Med, SocIns-GS Staff-TA	
	0.00	1,193.33	0.00	77245 - Dependency Allow - GS Staff-TA	
	0.00	6,080.54	0.00	77265 - Hazard Duty Stat Allow-GS-TA	
		1,081,97	0.00	77306 - Appoint-Tk cost-IP Staff-TA	
		7,200.00	0.00	77307 - Appoint-Sub Allow-IP Staff-TA	
	0.00	1,700.00	0.00	77309 - Appoint-shipment-IP Staff-TA	
		27,300.73	0.00	77310 - Post Adjustment - IP Staff-TA	
		4,741.00	0.00	77320 - Assg hardship & mob allow-TA	
		1,950.00		77335 - Hazard Duty Stat Allow-IP-TA	
0.00	0.00	3,552.00	0.00	77365 - Spec Oper Living Allow-IP-TA	
20,668.98	0.00	1,390,601.19	0.00	al for Fund 32045	
- 1,838,393.07	0.00	4,397,562.23	0.00	al for Dept : 42403	
0.00	0.00	4,404,362.67	0.00	al for Project : 00076295	
	0.00 0.00 2,518.10 0.00 0.00 18,150.88 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00	UN Agencies Encumbrance 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 2,518.10 0.00 2,518.10 0.00 0.00 0.00 18,150.88 0.00 0.00	UNDP Disb UN Agencies Encumbrance 11,000 00 0.00 0.00 160,848 27 0.00 0.00 6,755.20 0.00 0.00 13,934.86 0.00 0.00 122,922.02 0.00 18,158 60,341.58 0.00 0.00 129,518.85 0.00 0.00 16,629.37 0.00 0.00 1,629.37 0.00 0.00 2,083.28 0.00 0.00 1,829.37 0.00 0.00 2,083.28 0.00 0.00 660,31.49 0.00 0.00 14,986.89 0.00 0.00 3,595.93 0.00 0.00 19,77 0.00 0.00 19,77 0.00 0.00 19,77 0.00 0.00 19,77 0.00 0.00 19,77 0.00 0.00 19,77 0.00 0.00 19,77 0.00 0.00	Govt Disb UNDP Disb UN Agencies Encumbrance 0.00 11.000.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 160.848.27 0.00 2.518.10 0.00 8.755.20 0.00 0.00 0.00 18.934.86 0.00 0.00 0.00 18.934.86 0.00 0.00 0.00 152.92.02 0.00 18.150.88 0.00 60.341.58 0.00 0.00 0.00 2.083.28 0.00 0.00 0.00 1.629.37 0.00 0.00 0.00 2.022.47 0.00 0.00 0.00 442.712.45 0.00 0.00 0.00 443.320.33 0.00 0.00 0.00 4.60.21 0.00 0.00 0.00 2.93.60 0.00 0.00 0.00 2.93.60 0.00 0.00 0.00 2.8637.60 0.00 0.00 0.00 2.8647.60 0.00 0.00<	

0.00 0.00 2,565,969.60 Award Total : 0.00 4,404,362.67 Euform Signed By Date Douglas Hageman Country Director a.i. United Nations Development Program Islamabed, Pekistan yes

Financial Audit Report: Early Recovery Programme Project ID:00076295



Statement of expenditure (CDR) For the period from 01 January 2011 to 31 December 2011

OP UN Developme		Combined De	livery Report By Proj	ect		
UN DP UN Developme Report ID: ungi143;	nt Programme				Page 4 of Run Time:	4 16-05-2013 09:05:23
Selection Criteria :						
	AK10 In-Dec (2011) ALL : ALL ALL 00076295					
Award Id : 000605	51 ER Programme for flood af	fted	Period :	Jan-Dec (2011)		
Project # :	Community Capacity Build		Impl. Partner : Location :	None Pakistan		
	L	Govt Disb	UNDP Disb	UN Agencies	Encumbrance	Total Exp
42402 - Pak	kistan - Central kistan - UN Dev Coord kistan - Crisis Prev & Rcvry	0.00 0.00 0.00	6,777.77 22.67 4,397,562.23	0.00 0.00 0.00	0.00 0.00 - 1,838,393.07	6,777.77 22.67 2,559,169.16
					ENEMM Constant And	ounting s

ARACHI

585



Statement of expenditure (CDR) For the period from 01 January 2012 to 31 March 2012

Combined Delivery Report By Project

UN DP UN Development Programme Report ID: unglcdrp

Page 1 of 4 Run Time: 04-12-2012 04:12:46

Selection Criteria :

8

Business Unit : PAK10 Period : Jan-March (2012) Selected Project Id : ALL Selected Fund Code : ALL Selected Dept. IDs : ALL Selected Outputs : 00076295

Project Id : 00060551 ER Programme fo Output # : 00076295 Community Capac		Period : Impl. Partner : Location :	Jan-March (2012) 02373 UNDP (Direct Execution) Pakistan	
	Govt Exp	UNDP Exp	UN Agencies Exp	Total Exp
Dept: 42403 (Pakistan - Crisis Prev & R	cvry)			
Fund: 32045 (JPN-Partnership Devt. Pg	m. PCF)			
71610 - Travel Tickets-Local 72605 - Grants to Instit & other Bee 75105 - Facilities & Admin - Impler 76120 - Unrealized Loss		- 10.72 - 17,670.33 - 1,237.67 1,220.19	0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00	- 10.72 - 17,670.33 - 1,237.67 1,220.19
Total for Fund 32045	0.00	- 17,698.53	0.00	- 17,698.53
Total for Dept: 42403	0.00	- 17,698.53	0.00	- 17,698.53
Total for Output: 00076295	0.00	- 17,698.53	0.00	- 17,698.53
Project Total :	0.00	-17,698.53	0.00	- 17,698.53



Signed By : Date : 2013 May Date : Signed By : Douglas Hageman Country Director a.i. Onited Nations Development Programme Islamabad, Pakistan spe



Statement of expenditure (CDR) For the period from 01 January 2012 to 31 March 2012

Combined Delivery Report By Project

DP UN Development Programme Report ID: unglcdrp

Page 2 of 4 Run Time: 04-12-2012 04:12:47

Selection Criteria :

3

Business Unit: PAK10 Period: Jan-March (2012) Selected Project Id: ALL Selected Fund Code: ALL Selected Dept. IDs: ALL Selected Outputs: 00076295

Project Id : ALL		Period :	Jan-March (2012)	
Output #: ALL		Impl. Partner : Location :		
	Govt Exp	UNDP Exp	UN Agencies Exp	Total Exp

- 17,698.53 0.00 42403 - Pakistan - Crisis Prev & Rcvry 0.00 - 17,698.53







Statement of expenditure (CDR) For the period from 01 January 2012 to 31 March 2012

Period : As at Mar 31, 2012
UNDP AMOUNT
97,781.51
0.00
0.00
0.00
0.00
Excent
ENFANA
otd Rhodes

KARACH





Statement of expenditure (CDR) For the period from 01 January 2012 to 31 March 2012

DIN Development Programme				Page 4 of	4
eport ID: unglcdrp				Run Time:	04-12-2012 04:12:5
		edule to Combined Delive S Adjustments as at 1 Jan			
election Criteria :					
usiness Unit : PAK10 elected Project(s): ALL elected Fund Code : ALL elected Output(s): 00076295					
Project Id: 00060551 ER Programme Output #: 00076295 Community Ca Impl. Partner: 02373 UNDP (D	e for flood affted pacity Building Direct Execution)				
Description	Account	Fund	Donor		Amount
Unliquidated Obligations Unliquidated Obligations	21015 21015	26931-CPR - DDR 32045-JPNPDPPCF	00012-UNDP 00141-JPN		6,806.58 20,668.98
fotal for Output: 00076295					27,475.56
Project Total :					27,475.56
					EUFAMA
					Cond Rhodes Sloar
					TERNST & YOUNG
					KARACH

NOTES :

UNDP adopted IPSAS on 1 January 2012 which recognizes an expense based on goods received and/or services rendered. Consequently, expenses related to some IPSAS opening balance would be duplicated in the 2012 CDRs because of the following:

Goods received or services rendered in 2012 on non-fixed asset open purchase orders raised prior to 2012 would be recognized as an expense in 2012. These were ULOs in 2011
2012 Inventory opening balances would be expensed in 2012 when goods are consumed or delivered
2012 Prepaid opening balances would be expensed in 2012 when goods are received or services rendered

RC

12

Financial Audit Report: Early Recovery Programme Project ID:00076295



Independent auditors' Report to the United Nation Development Programme (UNDP) in respect of "2010 Flood Response Early Recovery Programme" (Project ID 00076295)

We have audited the accompanying statement of assets ("the statement") of the UNDP Project **"2010 Flood Response Early Recovery Programme"** under **Project ID 00076295** as at 31 March 2012.

Management is responsible for the preparation of the statement of UNDP Project "2010 Flood Response Early Recovery Programme" under Project ID 00076295 and for such internal control as management determines is necessary to enable the preparation of the statement that are free from material misstatement, whether due to fraud or error.

Our responsibility is to express an opinion on the statement based on our audit. We conducted our audit in accordance with International Standards on Auditing. Those standards require that we comply with ethical requirements and plan and perform the audit to obtain reasonable assurance about whether the statement is free from material misstatement.

An audit involves performing procedures to obtain audit evidence about the amounts and disclosures in the statement. The procedures selected depend on the auditor's judgment, including the assessment of the risks of material misstatement of the statement, whether due to fraud or error. In making those risk assessments, the auditor considers internal control relevant to the Project's preparation of the statement in order to design audit procedures that are appropriate in the circumstances, but not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the effectiveness of the Project's internal control. An audit also includes evaluating the appropriateness of accounting policies used and the reasonableness of accounting estimates made by management, as well as evaluating the overall presentation of the statement.

We believe that the audit evidence we have obtained is sufficient and appropriate to provide a basis for our opinion.

In our opinion, the statement presents fairly, in all material respects, the balance of assets of the UNDP Project "2010 Flood Response Early Recovery Programme" under Project ID 00076295 amounting to \$0.058 million as at 31 March 2012 in accordance with the UNDP accounting policies.





-:2:-

We draw attention to the fact that, during the period, the Office's management has used two different accounting policies with respect to recognition of assets in the statements of expenditure (CDR) in respect of this Project. Prior to 31 December 2011, these were charged off as expenses in the statements of expenditure, whereas subsequent thereto, these have been recognized as assets and related depreciation has been charged in the statements of expenditure. The policy change resulted from UNDP Executive Board's decision to adopt International Public Sector Accounting Standards (IPSAS) w.e.f 01 January 2012.

Emil & Yong From Rluch Sidar Hyde

Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder Chartered Accountants Engagement Partner: Omar Mustafa Ansari

Date: 17 May 2013 Place: Karachi



Statement of Assets As at 31 March 2012

Statement of Assets and Equipment As at March 31, 2012

UNDP Country Office: Pakistan Project title: Early Recovery and Restoration of Flood Effected Communities in Pakistan Award ID:00060551 Project ID: 00076295 Period Covered from: January 2011 to March 2012

0, 194	24256(()946)0	(6000)	area area.
1	Mobile phone Nokia C-5 (2GB memory card)	C5-00	355358047939817
2	Mobile phone Nokia C-5(2GB memory card)	C5·00	355358047939601
3	Mobile phone Nokia C-5(2GB memory card)	C5·00	355358047942290
4	Mobile phone Nokia C-5(2GB memory card)	C5-00	355358047942555.00
5	Mobile phone Nokla C-5(2GB memory card)	C5-00	355358047939544.00
6	Mobile phone Nokla C-5(2GB memory card)	C5-00	355358/04/794027/8
7	Mobile phone Nokia C-5(2GB memory card)	C5-00	355358/04/793966/8
8	Mobile phone Nokia C-5(2GB memory card)	C5-00	353757/04/921575/7
9	Mobile phone Nokia C-5(2GB memory card)	C5·00	355358/04/794041/9
10	Mobile phone Nokia C-5(2GB memory card)	Nokia C5	3018482253.00
Photo	copler		
11	canon PR	Image runner2525	21FR230940
12	Printer	lmagerunne r 2525	F190800
13	Photocopier	Imagerunne r 2525	FRZ30936
14	Photocopier	lmagerunne r 2525	FRZ30895
Lapto	p Dell		
15	Laptop	Inspiron 1464	6259YK1

/sociality(Hot) Date	2000))3130 (2003)	tu	101W
26-Jan-11	\$ 170.	59 Functional	Hyderabad
26-Jan-11	\$ 170.	59 Functional	Hyderabad
26-Jan-11	\$ 170.	59 Functional	Hyderabad
26-Jan-11	\$ 170.	59 Functional	Hyderabad
26-Jan-11	\$ 170.	59 Functional	Hyderabad
20-Jan-11	\$ 170.	59 Functional	Multan
15-0ct-10	\$ 170.	.59 Functional	Multan
15-0ct-10	\$ 170.	.59 Functional	Multan
15-Oct-10	\$ 170.	.59 Functional	Multan
26-Jan-11	\$ 170	.59 Functional	Peshawar
	\$ 1,705.	88	
27-Nov-10	\$ 2,882	.35 Functional	Peshawar
27-Nov-10	\$ 2,882	.35 Functional	Sukkur
22-Oct-10	\$ 2,882	.35 Functional	Multan
22-0ct-10	\$ 2,882	.35 Functional	Hyderabad
	\$ 11,529	.41	
27-0ct-10	\$ 1,033	.88 Functional	Multan



al

UNDP PAKISTAN Project ID 00076295 Early Recovery Programme

Statement of Assets As at 31 March 2012

Statement of Assets and Equipment As at March 31, 2012

UNDP Country Office: Pakistan Project title: Early Recovery and Restoration of Flood Elfected Communities in Pakistan Award ID:00060551 Project ID: 00076295 Period Covered from: January 2011 to March 2012

5/36	():+(c((p))(c))	(3(0(4)	3014036
16	Laptop	Inspiron 1464	9VJLL1
17	Laptop	Inspiron 1464	7LS9YK1
18	Laptop	Inspiron 1464	H92JLL1
19	Laptop Dell	DELL Inspirion	7GP9FS1
20	Laptop Dell	DELL Inspirion	2846183941-182JLL1
21	Laptop Dell	DELL Inspirion	10646320645-4W2JLL1
22	Laptop Dell	DELL Inspirion	25883796997-BW2JLL
23	Laptop Dell	DELL Inspirion	3237361669-dw2JLL1
24	Laptop Dell	DELL Inspirion	41764398131X2JLL1
25	Laptop DELL	DELL In spion	1929983813-8v2JLL1
26	Laptop DELL	DELL In spion	494019100 -929P9FS1
27	Laptop DELL	DELL In spion	8GP9FS1
28	laptop dell	dell inspirion	17237133829-7x2JLLI
asJet	Printer		
29	Printer	Lsaer jet HP	CNC2Y03978
30	Printer	LeaserJet P2035	CNC2Y03992
Fax Ma	achine		

/requisition (0a(c)			(6(8))
27-Oct-10	\$ 1,033.88	Functional	Multan
27-Oct-10	\$ 1,033.88	Functional	Multan
27-Oct-10	\$ 1,033.88	Functional	Multan
27-Oct-10	\$ 1,033.88	Functional	Peshawar
27-Oct-10	\$ 1,033.88	Functional	Peshawar
27-Oct-10	\$ 1,033.88	Functional	Peshawar
27-Oct-10	\$ 1,033.88	Functional	Peshawar
27-Oct-10	\$ 1,033.88	Functional	Peshawar
27-Oct-10	\$ 1,033.88	Functional	Peshawar
27-Oct-10	\$ 1,033.88	Functional	Peshawar
27-Oct-10	\$ 1,033.88	Functional	Peshawar
27-Oct-10	\$ 1,033.88	Functional	Peshawar
27-Oct-10	\$ 947.04	Functional	Peshawar
	\$ 14,387.51		
27-Oct-10	\$ 317.14	Functional	Hyderabad
22-Oct-12	\$ 317.14	Functional	Muitan
	\$ 634.28		



Pro Mec

UNDP PAKISTAN Project ID 00076295 Early Recovery Programme

Statement of Assets As at 31 March 2012

Statement of Assets and Equipment As at March 31, 2012

UNDP Country Office: Pakistan Project title: Early Recovery and Restoration of Flood Effected Communities in Pakistan Award ID:00060551 Project ID: 00076295 Period Covered from: January 2011 to March 2012

5,840	(0)1.0(i)\$0(0)	(2006)	3000026
31	Fax Mechine	Panasonic	OFCWE052368
32	Fax Mechine	Panasonic	OFCWE052357
huray	3	-	
33	Setlite phone with sim	Made in korea	IMEI:35601300-389179-6
34	Setlite phone with sim	Made in korea	IMEI:35601300-390706-3
35	Setlite phone with sim	TZ550- 2510	IMEI: 35601300-402781-2
36	Setlite phone with sim	Prepaid	0088216 89835459
37	Setlite phone with sim	TZ550- 2510	IMEI: 35601300-389019-4
38	Setlite phone with sim	Prepaid	0088216 89835458
39	Setlite phone with sim	TZ5S0- 2510	IMEI: 35601300-391425-9
40	Setlite phone with sim	Postpaid	0088216 89805321
41	Setlite phone with sim	Postpaid	0088216 89805326
42	Setlite phone with sim	Postpaid	0088216 89805327
Chair			
43	Low back chair	N/A	N/A
44	Low back chair	N/A	N/A
45	Low back chair	N/A	N/A

Angola (Roni Dista			Southon	dity.
27-0ct-10	\$	247.06	Functional	Peshawar
27-Oct-10	\$	244.09		Hyderbad
	\$	491.15		
20-Jan-11	\$	705.91	Functional	Hyderabad
20-Jan-11	\$	705.91	Functional	Hyderabad
20-Jan-11	5	705.91	Functional	Multan
20-Jan-11	\$	705.91	Expired/ Out Of Balance	Multan
20-Jan-11	\$	705.91	Functional	Multan
20-Jan-11	\$	705.91	Expired/ Out Of Balance	Multan
20-Jan-11	\$	705.91	Functional	Multan
20-Jan-11	\$	705.91	Functional	Multan
20-Jan-11	\$	705.91	Functional	Multan
20-Jan-11	\$	705.91	Functional	Multan
	\$	7,059.10		
3-Sep-11	\$	152.25	Functional	Multan
3-Sep-11	\$	152.25	Functional	Multan
3-Sep-11	\$	152.25	Functional	Multan



UNDP PAKISTAN Project ID 00076295 Early Recovery Programme

Statement of Assets

As at 31 March 2012

Statement of Assets and Equipment As at March 31, 2012

UNDP Country Office: Pakistan

Project title: Early Recovery and Restoration of Flood Effected Communities in Pakistan Award ID:00060551

Project ID: 00076295

Period Covered from: January 2011 to March 2012

57.1860	(Monthly)	(\$664)	antinto
46	Low back chair	N/A	N/A
47	Low back chair	N/A	N/A
48	Low back chair	N/A	N/A
49	High back chair	N/A	N/A
50	High back chair	N/A	N/A
51	Chair Manager high back Airon	N/A	N/A
52	Chair Manager high back Airon	N/A	N/A
53	Chair Manager Low Back Alron		OF-92-MMB-L-10364
54	Chair Manager Low Back Airon		OF-92-MMB-L-10364
lgital	Camera		
55	Digital Camera	Power Shot A2200	248060010830.00
56	Digital Camera	Power Shot A2200	248060005050.00
57	Digital Camera	PowerShot A2201	268061001-349
58	Digital camera	Power Shot	DSC-W530 8381676
59	GPS		
60	GPS		
61	GPS		

Angel Blon Blief	sputation: (de i	(ond))on	Gilly
3·Sep·11	\$ 152.25	Functional	Multan
3-Sep-11	\$ 152.25	Functional	Multan
3-Sep-11	\$ 152.25	Functional	Multan
3-Sep-11	\$ 164.19	Functional	Multan
3-Sep-11	\$ 164.19	Functional	Multan
3-Sep-11	\$ 207.97	Functional	Multan
3-Sep-11	\$ 207.97	Functional	Multan
3-Sep-11	\$ 196.03	Functional	Multan
3-Sep-11	\$ 196.03	Functional	Multan
	\$ 2,049.87		
20-Apr-11	\$ 193.17	Functional	Sukkur
20-Apr-11	\$ 193.17	Functional	Sukkur
20-Apr-11	\$ 193,17	Functional	Multan
20-Apr-11	\$ 193.17	Functional	Peshawar
20-Apr-11	\$ 212.01	Functional	Peshawar
20-Apr-11	\$ 212.01	Functional	Peshawa
20-Apr-11	\$ 212.01	Functional	Peshawa



mac

UNDP PAKISTAN Project ID 00076295 Early Recovery Programme

Statement of Assets As at 31 March 2012

Statement of Assets and Equipment As at March 31, 2012

UNDP Country Office: Pakistan

Project title: Early Recovery and Restoration of Flood Effected Communities in Pakistan

Award ID:00060551

Project ID: 00076295

Period Covered from: January 2011 to March 2012

57 (No	9140(1)\$ 1 (0))	(A6p(-))	3.40.000
62	GPS		
AOTOR	ROLLA		
59	VHF (Radio Set)	Made in Japan by	672HDE4958
60	VHF (Radio Set)	Made in Japan by	672HDE4947
61	VHF (Radio Set)	Made in Japan by	67HDQ7634
62	VHF (Radio Set)	Made In Japan by	749HFW9541
63	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	672HDE4952
64	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	672HDE4954
65	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	672HDE4953
66	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	103TGA3266
67	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	672HDQ7626
68	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	672HDE4949
69	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	672HDE4944
70	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	672HDQ7628
71	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	672HDQ7624
72	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	672HD07621
73	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	

2000011R(0) 2004(-	A	equiation (6):1:	(consilition	elfe;
20-Apr-11	\$	212.01	Functional	Peshawar
	\$	1,620.73		
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Hyderabad
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Hyderabad
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Hyderabad
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Hyderabad
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Hyderabad
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Hyderabad
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	multan
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Installed in Vehicle	Multan
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Sukkur
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Sukkur
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Sukkur
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Sukkur
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Sukkur
10-Jul-10	\$	399,94	Functional	Sukkur
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Unfunctional	Sukkur



pris une

UNDP PAKISTAN Project ID 00076295 Early Recovery Programme

Statement of Assets

As at 31 March 2012

Statement of Assets and Equipment As at March 31, 2012

UNDP Country Office: Pakistan

Project title: Early Recovery and Restoration of Flood Effected Communities in Pakistan Award ID:00060551 Project ID: 00076295 Period Covered from: January 2011 to March 2012

i, tio	000 ptripibio	11000	59/61/06
74	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	672HDE4960
75	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	672HDE4955
76	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	672HDE7638
77	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	749TJGD029
78	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	672HDE4960
79	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	672HDE4718
80	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	
81	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	1
82	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	
83	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	1
84	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	
85	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	
86	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	
87	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	
88	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	
89	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	
90	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	

acque difen Date		13Hon Hit	Conditions	uliy.
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Peshawar
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Peshawar
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Peshawar
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Peshawar
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Peshawar
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Peshawar
10-Jul-10	s	399.94	Functional	Islamabad
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Islamabad
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Islamabad
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Islamabad
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Islamabad
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Islamabad
10-Jul-10	5	399.94	Functional	Islamabad
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Islamabad
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Islamabad
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Islamabad
10-Jul-10	5	399.94	Functional	Islamabad



Re

UNDP PAKISTAN Project ID 00076295 Early Recovery Programme

Statement of Assets As at 31 March 2012

Statement of Assets and Equipment As at March 31, 2012

UNDP Country Office: Pakistan Project title: Early Recovery and Restoration of Flood Effected Communities in Pakistan Award ID:00060551 Project ID: 00076295 Period Covered from: January 2011 to March 2012

5, (10)	an sellenten	15(6)()*	Bardan Ro.
91	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	
92	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	
93	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	
94	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	
95	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	
96	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	
97	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	
98	VHF (Radio Set)	GP-380	
UPS			
80	UPS	650VA	4B1013P39286
81	UPS	650VA	4b1013P39203
82	UPS	650VA	4b1013P39215
83	UPS	650VA	4B1013P41310
84	UPS	650VA	4B1013P39243
85	UPS	650VA	4B1013P39193
86	UPS	650VA	4B1013P39228
87	UPS	650VA	4B1021P26688

angutaRon (04)	4	त्वाधनेतिक (त्वाध	anilitles	iell(y	
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Islamabad	
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Islamabad	
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Islamabad	
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Islamabad	
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Islamabad	
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Islamabad	
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	Islamabad	
10-Jul-10	\$	399.94	Functional	islamabad	
	\$	15,997.65			
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Hyderabad	
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Hyderabad	
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional		
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Multan	
22-Oct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Multan	
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Multan	
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Multan	
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Peshawar	





Statement of Assets As at 31 March 2012

Statement of Assets and Equipment As at March 31, 2012

UNDP Country Office: Pakistan Project title: Early Recovery and Restoration of Flood Effected Communities in Pakistan Award ID:00060551 Project ID: 00076295 Period Covered from: January 2011 to March 2012

5.3%	0(±6)/jillon	(3061)	151814130
88	UPS	650VA	4B1013P39242
89	UPS	650VA	4B1013P41305
90	UPS	650VA	4b1013P40059
91	UPS	650VA	
92	UPS	650VA	
93	UPS	650VA	
94	UPS	650VA	
95	UPS	650VA	
96	UPŚ	650VA	
97	UPS	650VA	
98	UPS	650VA	
99	UPS	650VA	
100	UPS	650VA	
101	UPS	650VA	
102	UPS	650VA	
103	UPS	650VA	
104	UPS	650VA	

/20000633367 (0).335	155003B00 ,663	readility	elity/
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Not Functional	Peshawar
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Functional	Peshawar
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Functional	Peshawar
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Functional	İslamabad
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$ 82.61	Functional	Islamabad



Prope

I ERNST & YOUNG

UNDP PAKISTAN Project ID 00076295 Early Recovery Programme

Statement of Assets

As at 31 March 2012

Statement of Assets and Equipment As at March 31, 2012

UNDP Country Office: Pakistan Project title: Early Recovery and Restoration of Flood Effected Communities in Pakistan Award ID:00060551 Project ID: 00076295 Period Covered from: January 2011 to March 2012

5.180	of compilian	(M(dol)	460(13076)
105 UF	25	650VA	
106 UF	95	650VA	
107 UF	95	650VA	
108 UF	S	650VA	
109 UF	95	650VA	
110 UF	5	650VA	
111 UF	95	650VA	
112 UF	PS	650VA	
113 UF	25	650VA	
114 UF	s	650VA	

Ziegofalikon 1954:		(1914) (1914)	Condition	(187
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Islamabac
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Islamabac
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Islamabac
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Islamabac
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Islamabad
22-0ct-10	\$	82.61	Functional	Islamabad
Sub total Grand Total	\$ 5	2,891.41		

BeenchAi Prepared by Finance Associate ARIF

mener Certified by **Operations Manager**

Certified by **Country Director** 201 Douglas Hageman

Country Director a.l. United Nations Development Programmo Islamabad, Pakistan Ernst & Young

Assurance | Tax | Transactions | Advisory

About Ernst& Young

Ernst & Young is a global leader in assurance, tax, transaction and advisory services. Worldwide, our people are united by our shared values and an unwavering commitment to quality. We make a difference by helping our people, our clients and our wider communities achieve potential.

For more information, please visit www.ey.com

Ernst & Young refers to the global organization of member firms of Ernst & Young Global Limited, each of which is a separate legal entity. Ernst & Young Global Limited, a UK company limited by guarantee, does not provide services to clients

EYFRSH in Pakistan is a member firm of Ernst & Young Global Limited (EYGL), a company incorporated under the laws of England & Wales. EYFRSH is legally an independent Partnership firm, registered under the law of Partnership as applicable in Pakistan.

Ernst & Young Ford RhodesSidatHyder Chartered Accountants Progressive Plaza, Beaumont Road, Karachi, Pakistan

Phone: (92 51) 2870290 - 92 (92 21-3) 5638238 - 42 Fax: (92 51) 2870293

E-mail: <u>omar.mustafa@pk.ey.com</u> ashoke.kumar@pk.ey.com

© Ernst & Young 2013. All rights reserved.



Empowered lives. Resilient nations.

United Nations Development Programme Pakistan

Management Letter

Early Recovery Programme in Pakistan

Project ID: 00076295

Audit Period: From 01 January 2010 to 31 March 2012

Contents

1. Ex	ecutive Summary 1
1.1	Audit Rating 2
1.2	Key issues and recommendations 3
2. Au	dit Objectives, Scope and Operational Overview 4
2.1	Audit Objectives and Scope 4
2.2	Audit Scope 5
2.3	Project Audit Visit Data 6
2.4	Operational Overview
3. De	tailed Audit Observations
3.1	Organization & staffing
3.2	Project management
3.3	Human resource management11
3.4	Cash and financial management12
3.5	Procurement management14
3.6	Assets management15
3.7	General administration management16
3.8	Information system management16
Definitio	ons of audit terms - Ratings and Priorities17
A. Au	ıdit ratings17
B. Pr	iorities of audit recommendations18
Glossa	ry19

ERNST & YOUNG

1. Executive Summary

We have been engaged by the Office of Audit and Investigations (OAI) of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) to conduct audit of the Project Early Recovery Programme in Pakistan, [Project ID: 00076295, Award ID: 00060551] (the Project) directly implemented by UNDP Pakistan (the Office). The audit was conducted from 18 October 2012 to 15 January 2013.

The purpose of the audit was to provide reasonable assurance with regard to the following areas:

- a) Reliability and integrity of Project financial and operational information;
- b) Effectiveness and efficiency of Project operations;
- c) Safeguarding of assets; and
- d) Compliance with legislative mandates, regulations and rules, policies and procedures, as well as donor agreements.

The audit scope included the following aspects of the Project:

- a) Reviewing the Combined Delivery Reports of the Project for the period from 01 January 2010 to 31 March 2012; and
- b) Reviewing the Statement of Assets and Equipment held by the Project as at 31 March 2012.

The audit covered programme and operations, and other relevant activities of the Project undertaken by management during the period from 1 January 2010 to 31 March 2012 at the Office. During the period reviewed, the Project recorded expenses totaling \$5.689 million.

UERNST&YOUNG

1.1 Audit Rating

Audit assessed the overall level of internal control with respect to the Project (Early Recovery Programme in Pakistan – Project ID: 00076295) is considered to be Project Office as **Partially Satisfactory**, which means that "Internal controls, governance and risk management processes were generally established and functioning, but needed improvement. One or several issues were identified that may negatively affect the achievement of the objectives of the audited entity."

Audit Areas	Not Assessed/Not Applicable	Unsatisfactory	Partially Satisfactory	Satisfactory
Organization & Staffing				
Project Management				
Human Resource Management				
Cash & Financial Management				
Procurement Management				
Assets Management				
General Administration Management				
Information System Management				
Follow up of previous audits				



URENST & YOUNG

1.2 Key issues and recommendations

1.2.1. The audit raised 22 issues that resulted in nine recommendations, all of the recommendations were ranked as low priority, meaning "Action is desirable and should result in enhanced control or better value for money". Issues with low priority were reported separately to the management of the Office.

We wish to express our appreciation to the management and staff of UNDP Pakistan for the assistance and cooperation extended to the audit team during the course of our engagement.

Emil & Yong Fred Rent Sider Hyde

Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder Chartered Accountants Engagement Partner: Omar Mustafa Ansari

Date: 17 May 2013 Place: Karachi



2. Audit Objectives, Scope and Operational Overview

2.1 Audit Objectives and Scope

- 2.1.1. The purpose of the audit undertaken by Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder was to:
 - Provide an assurance that there exists an adequate operational and internal control systems to ensure that the Projects are properly managed in accordance with the policies and procedures of UNDP for the achievement of their objectives with due regard for economy and efficiency.
 - Express an opinion on whether the expense incurred and recorded in the Combined Delivery Reports of the Project for the period from 01 January 2010 to 31 March 2012 present fairly the expense incurred on the Projects and whether the expense were incurred according to the approved budgets, for the approved purposes of the Project and were incurred according to the UNDP policies and guidelines and were supported by properly approved vouchers and invoices; and
 - Express an opinion on the Statement of Assets and Equipment held by the Project as at 31 March 2012 whether the statement present fairly the balance of the inventory of the Projects in all material respects.

2.1.2. The overall objective of the audit is to assess the management of the Project operations with the view of obtaining reasonable assurance towards the achievement of the Project objectives. The areas of focus include:

- a) Reliability and integrity of Project financial and operational information;
- b) Effectiveness and efficiency of Project operations;
- c) Safeguarding of assets; and
- d) Compliance with legislative mandates, regulations and rules, policies and procedures, as well as donor agreements.



2.2 Audit Scope

2.2.1. The audit reviewed the operations for the period from 1 January 2010 to 31 March 2012 covering the following areas:

- i. **Organization and staffing:** Assessed the overall Project structure for effective workflows and management arrangements, including assignment of authority, accountability and responsibility to employee;
- ii. **Project Management:** Assessed the management aspects in terms of approval of the Project, financial management of Project funds, and monitoring of implementation towards achievement of objectives. This included reporting to the, Steering Committee, Project Board and/or Donors;
- iii. **Human Resources:** Assessed competitiveness and transparency of the recruitment process; and effectiveness of the management of Project personnel, including contract administration, performance evaluation and payment of salaries and allowances;
- iv. **Financial and Cash Management:** Assessed the compliance with UNDP policies with respect to the safe custody and adequate management of cash, commitment of expenses against approved budget, disbursement or payment against liabilities and cash advances to field offices, Project employee, etc;
- v. **Procurement:** Assessed whether goods, services and civil works for the Project are procured competitively and in a transparent manner in accordance with UNDP policies and procedures. This included management of obligations and appropriate assessment of goods or services delivered and monitoring performance of the contractors, before payment;
- vi. **Asset Management:** Assessed whether Project assets are adequately recorded, safeguarded, monitored, including periodic physical verification of their use and existence;
- vii. **General Administration:** These included areas of operations not specifically covered above and for which expenses were charged to the Project covering such areas as; travel of Project employee, use and maintenance of Project vehicles, lease and maintenance of office premises;
- viii. **Information Systems:** This includes assessment of efficiency and security of information system established and maintained from Project funds and their adequacy to meet management and reporting requirements to the Projects. Based on our discussion with OAI, access to Atlas system is restricted to the UNDP Project employees. Therefore, our procedures are restricted to inquiries only; and
- ix. **Follow up on previous audits:** As per Project Manager, this is the first year of audit. Therefore, this section is not applicable.



2.3 Project Audit Visit Data

2.3.1. The audit was carried out at the Office during the period 18 October 2012 to 15 January 2013.

2.3.2. The Office funded \$5 million to 22 RPs for the implementation of the Project activities. The audit firm reviewed expenses amounted to \$4.8 million incurred by the 18 RPs, which covered 94% of total funding to RPs, for the financial audit and audit of internal controls and systems.

2.3.3. The debriefing meeting was held on 22 January 2012 to discuss the key issues / observations noticed during the audit. The preliminary audit findings were communicated to the Office on 31 January 2012. Management responses to our findings were received on 21 March 2013 and further comments and explanations were provided on 29 April 2013. The management responses have been taken into consideration in finalizing this audit report.

2.4 Operational Overview

Project Background

2.4.1. In response to the devastating floods that hit Pakistan from July to September 2010, the Office launched a comprehensive programme in support of early recovery and restoration of flood affected communities. In close partnership with disaster management authorities at national, provincial and district levels, local government institutions, affected communities, and, where possible, the private sector, the programme required to restore safe and enabling environments for flood-affected communities in thirty nine severely and moderately affected districts to recover from the impact of the floods by focusing on achieving three strategic and interlinked outputs:

- a) Capacities of local institutions and flood-affected communities for recovery and protection of rights restored;
- b) Livelihoods of vulnerable flood-affected people stabilized and restored; and
- c) Basic and critical community infrastructure and services restored.

2.4.2. The Office allocated the total grant of \$5.689 million for the Project which was contributed by the following:

Donor	Contribution (\$ millions)
Bureau of Crisis Prevention and Recovery	2.550
Targeted Resources Among Countries 3	1.745
Government of Japan	1.394
Total funding	5.689



URENST & YOUNG

Management

2.4.3. The Project is implemented through the DIM modality by the Office in consultation with its partners.

Project operations

2.4.4. The Project is managed by a Project Manager recruited by the Office. The Project Manager is responsible for day-to-day management and decision-making for the Project, as well as ensuring that the Project produces the results specified in the Project document, to the required standard of quality and within the specified constraints of time and cost. The Project Manager is assisted by an administrative team.

Brief Overview of the Project

Audit Period	1 January 2010 to 31 March 2012
Budget allocated during the audit period	\$5,689,550
Expenses during the audit period	\$5,689,550
Percentage Utilisation	100%

2.4.5. The reporting currency for the report is United States Dollar (\$). All the amounts in functional currency (i.e. Pakistani Rupees) are converted at the rate of 85 per 1\$ for reporting purpose. Amounts are rounded off to nearest million.

2.4.6. Since this project is executed under the Direct Implementation (DIM) modality. In such case the Office is responsible for overall performance and achievement of project objectives even though they may engage Responsible Party (RP) for execution of project activities. Our assessment of internal controls and ratings for internal control areas is based on the assessment of the controls established and implemented by the Office and RPs relevant to this project.

2.4.7. The audit firm would like to remind that although audit was performed with due professional care, an audit of internal controls and systems is not a guarantee that all control weaknesses or frauds will be detected. Also matters arising during our review, which are not regarded as report issues, were brought to the attention of UNDP at the time of the review.



3. Detailed Audit Observations

3.1 Organization & staffing

The audit firm reviewed the overall Project structure for effective workflows and management arrangements, including assignment of authority, accountability and responsibility to employee.

The audit firm noted few low risk observations, which have been reported to Office for information and control improvements.

Considering the mitigating controls and the general control environment of the project, we consider the rating of this area Satisfactory.

3.2 Project management

Partially Satisfactory

Satisfactorv

The audit firm reviewed the management aspects in terms of approval of the Project, financial management of the Project funds, and monitoring of implementation towards achievement of objectives. This included reporting to the, Steering Committee, Project Board and / or Donors.

3.2.1. The audit firm reviewed the project management structure and noted the following internal control improvements for the Office to consider adopting in the future:

- a) The Office did not develop a formal process for capturing the complaints at the regional offices of the Project. Project Manager informed that the minor issues identified by the complainants were resolved on site however logs were not maintained for record purpose. The audit firm recommends that formal complaint management system should be developed and all the complaints received should be logged and their resolution should be documented.
- b) The audit firm noted that the project budget was developed at award level (for Early Recovery projects), budgets specific to the project was not developed. The audit firm reviewed the activity wise CDRs with the output wise budget available in the donor agreement at award level and noted that there were minor deviations of actual expenses with the donor approved budget. However, overall CDRs were consistent with the donor approved budget. The audit firm recommends that Project Manager should develop project level budgets and perform the variance analysis between budgets and actual expenditure.

I ERNST & YOUNG

Issue 1 Absence of minutes of meeting of bid opening committee at the Office

The audit firm noted that request for proposal to (CSOs) was raised on 16 September 2010 for CSOs with the submission timeline on or before 20 September 2010. The submitted proposals were opened on 22 September 2010 by the bid opening committee. However, minutes of the meeting of the bid opening committee were not available for review.

Minutes of the bid opening committee is an important control to establish that appropriate bid opening and evaluation process was followed. There were around 114 proposals out of which 18 were selected by the Office for the award of Micro Capital Grants (MCGs). Due to absence of documented minutes of bid opening committee there was no audit trail to assess the criteria for the evaluation of proposals received.

Comment:

The audit firm is not making any recommendation as the project is closed at the date of review.

Issue 2 <u>Weaknesses noted in the Project Management at the Office</u>

The audit firm noted the following weaknesses in the project management structure of the Project:

- a) The audit firm identified that the Project operations started in 2010 under the DIM modality and the Office obtained the post facto approval from Regional bureau on 19 December 2011;
- b) As per Project document (not dated), the Project required to be completed by August 2011. However, the Project was operationally completed in March 2012. UNDP Project team did not request the extension of Project duration which is inconsistent with UNDP policies and procedures;
- c) Project monitoring was performed by the field offices in accordance with the monitoring plan. However, during review of field monitoring reports, the audit firm noted that follow up logs of risks and observations identified during the field visits by the monitoring team were not documented which resulted in duplication of monitoring efforts;
- d) The audit firm noted that Micro-Capital Grant agreements were entered with 18 RPs under the project. Out of these Grants to 15 RPs exceeds \$ 150,000 under individual agreement. However; as per expense management policy of UNDP "...an individual micro-capital grant by UNDP may not exceed by \$150,000."
- e) The audit firm noted that Project Board, composed of representatives from Economic Affairs Division, Donor Agencies and the Office, was established as oversight body for monitoring the progress of the Project. Project Board meetings were held to discuss the status of the Project, minutes of the meetings were drafted and recommendations were noted and forwarded to ERP management for implementation. The audit firm noted that



various recommendations were made by the Project Board such as establishment of clear interface between the Project Board members for rescue, relief and early recovery operations, development of clear road map of ERP, maintenance of proper data of program beneficiaries, establishment of regular monitoring and reporting system and etc. However, there is no formal mechanism for reporting the follow-up actions on recommendations of Project Board; and

f) The audit firm noted that the Office prepared only one annual work plan in the Project life which is for the year 2011. Further, the work plan was prepared on award basis and not on the Project basis. Therefore, it was difficult to make comparisons of actual expenses with the annual work plan;

Comment:

The audit firm is not making any recommendation as the project is closed at the date of review.

Issue 3 Non compliances with the MCGs clauses by Responsible Parties

The audit firm reviewed the Project management structure of the RPs applicable to the Project and identified eight instances where RPs changed the MCGs' activities without obtaining prior approval from the Office (such as inconsistent hiring of project staff as mentioned in MCGs, payment of excess salaries from the approved budget and charging of utility expenses not approved in the MCGs budgets) which resulted in unapproved expenses amounted to \$57,245.

In case of 17 MCGs, RPs did not comply with the MCGs clauses such as safety and security of the Project employee, dedicated donor specific bank account, policy for record retention, intimation to the Office regarding unspent funds balances amounted to \$35,281 available at the completion of the Project, on time commencement and completion of the MCGs and on time submission of the periodic reports to the Office.

Comment:

The audit firm is not making any recommendation as the project is closed at the date of review.

In view of the above identified instances and control weaknesses, this area is rated partially satisfactory.



3.3 Human resource management

The audit firm reviewed the competitiveness and transparency of the recruitment process; and effectiveness of the management of Project personnel, including contract administration, performance evaluation and payment of salaries and allowances.

Issue 4 Weaknesses noted in the Human Resource management at the Office

The audit firm noted the following weaknesses in the Human Resource management structure of the Project:

- a) Human Resource (HR) Associate can add or delete employees in the payroll system. Upon any addition or deletion of an employee, a system generated email is sent to the HR manager as well as Project manager. However, system generated notifications for additions or deletions of employees from payroll system could not be generated from the beginning of the Project till January 2012. The audit firm identified that there were no substitute manual controls available to mitigate the risks associated with the payroll system prior to January 2012;
- b) The audit firm reviewed the 10 personnel files of the employees and noted that various documents were not available in the personnel files at the time of review and was provided subsequently by the Office which indicate absence of effective controls over personnel files management; and
- c) As per policy, minimum two reference letters should be obtained at the time of recruitment. However, one instance was identified where only one reference letter was obtained instead of two.

Comment:

The audit firm is not making any recommendation as the project is closed at the date of review.



UERNST&YOUNG

Issue 5 Weaknesses noted in the Human Resource Management at the RPs

The audit firm conducted the audit of MCGs awarded to the RPs and noted that following weaknesses in the HR management functions of three RPs:

- a) In case of 13 RPs, interview assessment procedures were not documented;
- b) In case of eight RPs, personnel files were not updated and documents such as Computerized National Identity Cards (CNICs), educational credentials, Offer letters and resume of the Project employees were not available in the files; and
- c) In 18 MCGs with RPs the audit firm noted absence of certain important policies and procedures in HR manual of 18 RPs such as policies and procedures for reference check of the selected employees, issuance of offer letters to the selected employees, job advertisements and attendance of the employees. Therefore, these policies were not followed by the RPs during the Project period.

Comment:

The audit firm is not making any recommendation as the project is closed at the date of review.

Considering the mitigating controls and the general control environment of the project, we consider the rating of this area Satisfactory.

3.4 Cash and financial management

Partially Satisfactory

The audit firm reviewed the compliance with UNDP policies with respect to the safe custody and adequate management of cash, commitment of expenses against approved budget, disbursement or payment against liabilities and cash advances to field offices, Project employee, etc.

Issue 6 Inappropriate classification of expenses in CDRs at the Office

The audit firm noted that the Office did not classify the grants to RP in relevant chart of accounts of the CDR rather the grants amounted to \$0.4 million were classified in account code 72605 "Grant to institute & other benefits" which does not give clarity on classification of expenses recorded in the CDR.

Comment:

The audit firm is not making any recommendation as the project is closed at the date of review.



UERNST&YOUNG

Issue 7 Non compliance with local laws by the Responsible Parties

The audit firm reviewed the financial management functions of the RPs applicable to the Project and identified the following:

- a) In six MCGs, RPs did not deduct the withholding tax amounted to \$26,135 from payments for goods and services which is non compliance with the local tax laws in Pakistan;
- b) In case of 11 MCGs the audit firm noted absence of preparation of periodic bank reconciliation; and
- c) One RP did not comply with minimum wage policy for the Project staff applicable in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province.

Comment:

The audit firm is not making any recommendation as the project is closed at the date of review.

Issue 8 Absence of common cost allocation criteria at the Office

The audit firm identified that three employees were providing services to various Projects under the Award of ERP. However, their cumulative salaries amounted to \$51,099 (\$7,588 per month) were charged to Project ID 77365 and not apportioned to all the Projects under the award including the Project under review.

Comment:

The audit firm is not making any recommendation as the project is closed at the date of review.

Issue 9 Absence of supporting documents at the Responsible Parties for the <u>Project expenses</u>

During audit of nine MCGs with the RPs, the audit firm identified various instances amounted to \$55,173 where supporting documents of the Project expenses were not available for verification purpose in the RPs records. These expenses were reported to the Office by the RPs in the periodic financial reports and same were updated in the CDRs. This indicates absence of effective financial monitoring of the RPs by the Office.

Comment:

The audit firm is not making any recommendation as the project is closed at the date of review.



Issue 10 Over / under statement in CDRs due to delay in receipts of financial reports from the Responsible Parties

The audit firm noted that for other cut-off dates i.e. as of 31 December 2010 and 31 December 2011, adjustment of advances / disbursements against expenses reported by RPs was not performed. Consequently individual CDRs remain understated or overstated by indeterminate amounts.

Comment:

The audit firm is not making any recommendation as the project is closed at the date of review.

In view of the above identified instances and control weaknesses, this area is rated partially satisfactory.

3.5 **Procurement management**

Satisfactory

The audit firm reviewed whether goods, services and civil works for the Project are procured competitively and in a transparent manner in accordance with UNDP policies and procedures. This included management of obligations and appropriate assessment of goods or services delivered and monitoring performance of the contractors, before payment.

Issue 11 Non compliance with local laws by the Responsible Parties

The audit firm reviewed the procurement management functions of the RPs applicable to the Project and identified the following:

- a) In four MCGs, procurement amounted to \$61,633 were identified where comparative statements of the quotations were not prepared by the procurement manager for the evaluation and basis for award of procurement contract to selected bidder;
- b) Three instances amounted to \$0.1 million were identified where RPs did not sign the formal contracts with the suppliers; and
- c) In 18 MCGs, the audit firm noted control weaknesses in the procurement management of 18 RPs such as absence of policy for tendering, composition of procurement committee, TORs of procurement committees were not available in the procurement manuals, absence of pre numbered goods received notes, dispute resolution and disagreements and contractual provision relating to anti-personnel mines and child labour clauses in the contracts with vendors. Therefore, these policies were not followed by the RPs during the Project period.



Comment:

The audit firm is not making any recommendation as the project is closed at the date of review.

Considering the mitigating controls and the general control environment of the project, we consider the rating of this area Satisfactory.

3.6 Assets management

Satisfactory

The audit firm reviewed whether the Project assets are adequately recorded, safeguarded, monitored, including periodic physical verification of their use and existence.

Issue 12 Weaknesses noted in the assets management

The audit firm reviewed the assets management functions of the Office applicable to the Project and identified the following:

a) The Office did not share the documentary evidences for the periodic physical count / reconciliations of the Project assets. The audit firm performed the physical verification of assets based on sample and noted absence of tagging of six laptops amounted to \$6,203.

The audit firm reviewed the assets management functions of the RPs applicable to the Project and identified the following:

- a) In two RPs, assets amounted to \$8,174 were not tagged as per UNDP guidelines mentioned in the MCGs for the assets identification;
- b) Six RPs did not intimate or return the remaining assets of the Project amounted to \$18,452 to the Office at the completion of the Project; and
- c) In seven RPs, the audit firm noted that either periodic inspection of fixed assets / supplies was not carried out or if RPs' management claims the exercise is carried out, no evidence is provided of such physical count exercise.

Comment:

The audit firm is not making any recommendation as the project is closed at the date of review.

Considering the mitigating controls and the general control environment of the project, we consider the rating of this area Satisfactory.



3.7 General administration management

The audit firm reviewed the areas of operations not specifically covered above and for which expenses were charged to the Project covering such areas as; travel of Project employee, use and maintenance of Project vehicles, lease and maintenance of office premises.

Issue 13 Weaknesses noted in the general administration function at the Office

The audit firm reviewed a sample of 23 trips. In 12 cases, Travel Authorization forms were missing; in 17 other cases, security clearance were not available; in eight cases, the F-10 forms for Daily Subsistence Allowance were missing.

Comment:

The audit firm is not making any recommendation as the project is closed at the date of review.

Considering the mitigating controls and the general control environment of the project, we consider the rating of this area Satisfactory.

3.8 Information system management

The audit firm procedures for Office were restricted to inquiries only since access to ATLAS was restricted. For RPs; the audit performed assessment of efficiency and security of information system established / maintained and their adequacy to meet management and reporting requirements to the projects.

The audit firm noted few low risk observations, which have been reported to Office for information and control improvements.

Considering the mitigating controls and the general control environment of the project, we consider the rating of this area Satisfactory.

Satisfactory



UERNST & YOUNG

Definitions of audit terms - Ratings and Priorities

A. Audit ratings

Within the operational audit context, performance refers to the economy, efficiency, and effectiveness of operations under management's control. Operational audits assess the extent to which resources are acquired and utilized with due regard to economy and efficiency and whether management has put in place mechanisms to accurately monitor and assess whether the programs are meeting planned objectives. Operational audits do not report on the achievement of results.

Performance also refers to the manner is which activities are conducted – i.e. whether they are conducted in accordance with UNDP values. UNDP values encompass the notions of prudence and probity, as well as the necessity of taking acceptable risks.

Satisfactory	Internal controls, governance and risk management processes were adequately established and functioning well. No issues were identified that would significantly affect the achievement of the objectives of the audited entity.
Partially Satisfactory	Internal controls, governance and risk management processes were generally established and functioning, but needed improvement. One or several issues were identified that may negatively affect the achievement of the objectives of the audited entity.
Unsatisfactory	Internal controls, governance and risk management processes were either not established or not functioning well. The issues were such that the achievement of the overall objectives of the audited entity could be seriously compromised.



URENST & YOUNG

B. Priorities of audit recommendations

The audit recommendations are categorized according to priority, as a further guide to UNDP management in addressing the issues. The following categories are used:

High (Critical)	Prompt action is required to ensure that UNDP is not exposed to high risks. Failure to take action could result in major negative consequences for UNDP and may affect the organization at the global level.
Medium (Important)	Action is required to ensure that UNDP is not exposed to significant risks. Failure to take action could result in negative consequences for UNDP.
Low	Action is desirable and should result in enhanced control or better value for money. Low priority recommendations, if any, are dealt with by the audit team directly with the Office management, either during the exit meeting or through a separate memo subsequent to the fieldwork. Therefore, low priority recommendations are not included in this report.



Glossary

CDR	Combined Delivery Reports
CSO	Civil Society Organization
DIM	Direct Implementation Modality
HR	Human Resource
ICF	Internal Control Framework
RP	Responsible Party
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
OAI	Office of Audit and Investigations
MCG	Micro Capital Grant
PKR	Pakistani Rupees
SC	Service Contract
ТА	Travel Authorization
The Office	UNDP Pakistan
The audit firm	Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder
\$	United States Dollar

Ernst & Young

Assurance | Tax | Transactions | Advisory

About Ernst & Young

Ernst & Young is a global leader in assurance, tax, transaction and advisory services. Worldwide, our people are united by our shared values and an unwavering commitment to quality. We make a difference by helping our people, our clients and our wider communities achieve potential.

For more information, please visit www.ey.com

Ernst & Young refers to the global organization of member firms of Ernst & Young Global Limited, each of which is a separate legal entity. Ernst & Young Global Limited, a UK company limited by guarantee, does not provide services to clients

EYFRSH in Pakistan is a member firm of Ernst & Young Global Limited (EYGL), a company incorporated under the laws of England & Wales. EYFRSH is legally an independent Partnership firm, registered under the law of Partnership as applicable in Pakistan.

Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder Chartered Accountants Progressive Plaza, Beaumont Road, Karachi, Pakistan

Phone: (92 51) 2870290 - 92 (92 21-3) 5638238 - 42 Fax: (92 51) 2870293

E-mail: <u>omar.mustafa@pk.ey.com</u> <u>ashoke.kumar@pk.ey.com</u>

© Ernst & Young 2013. All rights reserved.